History and Theory of Planning

Why do we do what we do?

Georgia Planning Association AICP Exam Review
January 18, 2013

What is planning?

- a universal human activity involving the consideration of outcomes before choosing amongst alternatives
- a deliberate, self-conscious activity
Primary functions of planning

- improve efficiency of outcomes
  - optimize
- counterbalance market failures
  - balance public and private interests
- widen the range of choice
  - enhance consciousness of decision making
- civic engagement
  - expand opportunity and understanding in community

What is the role of history and theory in understanding planning?

- planning is rooted in applied disciplines
  - primary interest in practical problem solving
- early planning theories emerged out of practice
  - planning codified as a professional activity
  - originally transmitted by practitioners via apprenticeships
- efforts to develop a coherent theory emerged in the 1950s and 60s
  - need to rationalize the interests and activities of planning under conditions of social foment
  - the social sciences as a more broadly based interpretive lens
Types of theories

- **theories of system operations**
  - How do cities, regions, communities, etc. work?
    - disciplinary knowledge such as economics and environmental science

- **theories of system change**
  - How might planners act?
    - disciplinary knowledge such as decision theory, political science, and negotiation theory
    - applied disciplines such as public administration and engineering

Pre-Modern Planning: Focus on Urban Design and Street System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Plan Type</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1682</td>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>Grid system &amp; neighborhood parks</td>
<td>William Penn, Thomas Holme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1695</td>
<td>Annapolis</td>
<td>Radiocentric</td>
<td>Francis Nicholson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1733</td>
<td>Savannah</td>
<td>Ward park system</td>
<td>Oglethorpe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1790</td>
<td>Washington</td>
<td>Grand, whole city plan</td>
<td>Pierre L'Enfant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1852-1870</td>
<td>Paris</td>
<td>Model for “City Beautiful”</td>
<td>Napoleon III; Haussmann</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1856</td>
<td>Central Park</td>
<td>First major purchase of parkland</td>
<td>F. L. Olmsted Sr</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New Urban Forms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Planner</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1869</td>
<td>Riverside, IL</td>
<td>Model curved street &quot;suburb&quot;</td>
<td>FL Olmsted Sr Calvert Vaux</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>Pullman, IL</td>
<td>Model industrial town</td>
<td>George Pullman</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Federal Government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1876</td>
<td>&quot;Munn v Illinois&quot;</td>
<td>US Supreme Court upholds regulation of private enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1887</td>
<td>Interstate Commerce Commission</td>
<td>First federal regulatory agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1892</td>
<td>US federal study of slums</td>
<td>First federal action on city problems</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### The Industrial City

![Image of children working in a factory](image_url)
The Industrial City

Planning Movements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Movement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>City Beautiful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860</td>
<td>City Beautiful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1870</td>
<td>City Efficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>Parks Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>Settlement Housing Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1900</td>
<td>Sanitary Reform &amp; Public Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1910</td>
<td>Garden City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1920</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1930</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Physical Determinism

Social Determinism
**Parks Movement**

- Frederick Law Olmsted and Calvert Vaux
  - Design of Central Park
- Horace W. S. Cleveland, Minneapolis
  - Park system proposal 1883;
- Charles Eliot & Sylvester Baxter, Boston
  - Extensive regional park system (1891-1893 and beyond)

---

**Response to the Emerging Industrial City: Public Health & Sanitary Reform Movement**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>Event Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1867</td>
<td>San Francisco</td>
<td>First modern land-use zoning in US (forbad slaughterhouses in geographic districts)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1867/1879</td>
<td>New York City</td>
<td>First major tenement house controls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1879</td>
<td>Memphis</td>
<td>60% of city flees from yellow fever; of those who remain, 80% get sick; 25% die</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### The Rise of a Social Conscience: Settlement House & Reform Movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Focus</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1888</td>
<td>&quot;Looking Backwards&quot;</td>
<td>Promoted city and national planning</td>
<td>Edward Bellamy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890-1892</td>
<td>&quot;How the Other Half Lives&quot; and &quot;Children of the Poor&quot;</td>
<td>Focused on slums and poverty</td>
<td>Jacob Riis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1889</td>
<td>Hull House in Chicago</td>
<td>Settlement house movement</td>
<td>Jane Addams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>Greenwich House</td>
<td>Helped organize the first National Conference on City Planning</td>
<td>Mary K. Simkovitch</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Garden City Movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Focus</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1898</td>
<td>&quot;Tomorrow: A Peaceful Path to Real Reform&quot;</td>
<td>Merge urban &amp; agrarian</td>
<td>Ebenezer Howard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1903-1920</td>
<td>Leetchworth</td>
<td>Two garden city projects</td>
<td>Welwyn introduces superblock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1919-1934</td>
<td>Welwyn</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1930 Plan for Greenbelt MD
**City Beautiful Movement**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Architect(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1893</td>
<td>Columbian Exposition</td>
<td>The “White City”</td>
<td>Burnham, Olmsted Sr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1902</td>
<td>McMillan Plan for Washington DC</td>
<td>Update of L'Enfant's Plan</td>
<td>Burnham, Olmsted Jr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1906</td>
<td>San Francisco Plan</td>
<td>First major application of City Beautiful in US</td>
<td>Daniel Burnham, Edward Bennett</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1909</td>
<td>Chicago Plan</td>
<td>First metro regional plan</td>
<td>Burnham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“Make no little plans; they have no magic...”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Make no little plans. They have no magic to stir men's blood and probably themselves will not be realized.

Make big plans; aim high in hope and work, remembering that a noble, logical diagram once recorded will never die, but long after we are gone will be a living thing, asserting itself with ever-growing insistency. Remember that our sons and grandsons are going to do things that would stagger us.

Let your watchword be order and your beacon beauty. Think big.
**Professionalization of Planning**

**1901**
- NYC: “New Law” regulates tenement housing

**1907**
- Hartford: first official & permanent local planning board

**1909**
- Washington DC: first planning association
- National Conference on City Planning
- Wisconsin: first state enabling legislation permitting cities to plan
- Chicago Plan: Burnham creates first regional plan
- Los Angeles: first land use zoning ordinance
- Harvard School of Landscape Architecture: first course in city planning

"Canyon Streets" in NYC: targets of zoning
Progressive Movement as Reform

- Political and economic reaction against
  - influence of corporations; monopolies (Rockefeller)
  - influence of corrupt ward bosses (Tamany Hall) because of dispersed, decentralized power of elected officials
- Loss of control of central cities by elites as democracy spread
  - elites moving to streetcar suburbs; dislocation of economic and political power
- Emergence of corporate models of management
  - strong executive leadership
- Rationalize and professionalize city governance
  - rationalize city service provision and infrastructure development
  - civil service
  - depoliticize city

New York City Zoning Maps, 1916
The City Efficient: Developing Tools for Planning

- 1913
  - Massachusetts: planning mandatory for local gov'ts; planning boards required
- 1916
  - New York: first comprehensive zoning ordinance
- 1917
  - American City Planning Institute established in Kansas City
- 1923
  - Standard State Zoning Enabling Act issued by US Dept of Commerce
  - Los Angeles County establishes planning board
- 1925
  - Cincinnati: first comprehensive plan based on welfare of city as a whole
- 1926
  - Euclid vs. Ambler Realty Co: Supreme Court upholds comprehensive zoning

Zoning Map of Zion, Illinois, c. 1920
1920s
- Robert Moses replaces Burnham as leading American planner:
  - “If the ends don’t justify the means, then what the hell does?”

1928
- Standard City Planning Enabling Act issued by US Dept of Commerce

1929
- Radburn NJ completed
  - innovative neighborhood design based on Howard’s theory
- Harvard: Creates first school of city planning
- Regional Plan of New York completed
- “Regional Plan of New York and Its Environs” published

Depression
- Challenge of systemic poverty
**Depression Era Innovations**

- **National urban/urbanization policy**
  - National Resources Planning Board
  - New Deal economic management
  - Housing and work/welfare programs
- **Regionalism**
  - Tennessee Valley Authority (TVA)

- **Planning**
  - 1934: American Society of Planning Officials formed

- **Planning education**
  - Movement from apprentice-based education to social science-based
  - Emergence of modern planning theories based on rationality
    - Chicago school

**Increasing Importance of Cities**

- 1937: Our Cities: Their Role in the National Economy.
  - A landmark report by the Urbanism Committee of the National Resources Committee
- 1941
  - Local Planning Administration, by Ladislas Segoe, first of "Green Book" series, appears
Focus on Physical Planning

1938 The American Institute of Planners states as its purpose

“... the planning of the unified development of urban communities and their environs, and of states, regions and the nation, as expressed through determination of the comprehensive arrangement of land uses and land occupancy and the regulation thereof.”

Mass Migrations: 1950s – 1970s

Inner city whites to suburbs

Northwestern Whites: Rustbelt to Sunbelt due to air conditioning

Washington: first major minority city in 1960

African American: WW1 and 2
Urban Renewal and General Planning

**1949** Housing Act (Wagner-Ellender-Taft Bill)
- First comprehensive housing legislation
- Aimed to construct 800,000 housing units
- Inaugurated urban renewal

**1954** Housing Act of 1954.
- Stressed slum prevention and urban renewal rather than slum clearance and urban redevelopment as in the 1949 act.
- Stimulated general planning for cities under 25,000 (Section 701)
- "701 funding" later extended to foster statewide, interstate, and substate regional planning.

**1954** Berman v. Parker
- US Supreme Court upholds DC Redevelopment Land Agency to condemn unsightly, though non-deteriorated, properties in accordance with area redevelopment plan

**1964** T.J. Kent publishes *The Urban General Plan.*
Modernism

- Aesthetics and form
  - Rejected historic precedent as a source of architectural inspiration
  - Considered function as the prime generator of form
  - Employed materials and technology in an honest way.

- Morphological characteristics of buildings
  - Style-free plan
  - Universal space
  - Walls freed from the function of load bearing
  - Cantilevers
  - Glass at corners of buildings
  - Use of concrete

Urban Renewal: Lancaster, PA
Northern Savings & Trust Company, 1956
Lancaster Commercial Center
Completed 1971

West End becomes Charles River Park
Social Critique

Jane Jacobs

Herbert Gans

Urban Design Theorists

1960
Image of the City by Kevin Lynch

basic elements of "imageability"

- paths
- edges
- nodes
- districts
- landmarks
1962 The urban growth simulation model emerges in the Penn-Jersey Transportation Study.

1968 Pittsburg Community Redevelopment Model

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis
- Regionalizing/nationalizing of planning
- Social science as a tool of planning
- Focus on econ development & social policy

1870 Era of Urban Industrialization

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis

1915 Roaring '20s & Progressive Era

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis

1928 The Depression Era & Urban Stagnation

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis

1945 Post-WWII Modernism Suburbanization & Central City Decline

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis

1960 Social Activism, Federal Policy & Regional Cities

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis

1980 Retreat from Policy Privatization

- Need for more systematic and forward-thinking action
- Concepts linking planning, research, action
- Imbedded in architecture, engineering, social work
- Planning as a profession and public institution
- Physical determinism: City Beautiful & City Efficient
- Focus on land use & comprehensive analysis

2013
Why do we not have a unifying theory of planning? (Rittel and Webber)

- goals and objectives, as well as means to achieve them, are often uncertain
  - “wicked problems”
  - concerned primarily with public issues
    - broadly defined groups/clients
    - diverse interests
- planners rarely make decisions but rather advise those who do
- results of most planning activity is discernable only 5 to 20 years after the decision
  - feedback and corrective actions are difficult

What are “wicked” problems?

- A problem for which each attempt to create a solution changes the understanding of the problem.
- Problem definition evolves as new possible solutions are considered and/or implemented
- Not the same as an intractable problem
  "One cannot build a freeway to see how it works"
Characteristics of “wicked” problems

- No definitive formulation of a wicked problem.
- No stopping rule.
- Solutions are not true-or-false, but good-or-bad.
- No immediate and no ultimate test of a solution.
- Every wicked problem is essentially unique.
  - All attempts are significant
- No enumerable set of potential solutions
- Every problem can be considered a symptom of another problem
- Can be explained in numerous ways. The choice of explanation determines the nature of the problem's resolution.
- The planner has no right to be wrong.

Hard-to-Formalize, Contextualized, Multidisciplinary, Organizational Knowledge

---

For every complex problem there is a simple solution, and it is wrong.

H.L. Menken
The diversity of theories

Linkage Between Knowledge and Action

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Desired Outcome</th>
<th>System Improving</th>
<th>System Transforming</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Rationality</td>
<td>Synoptic rationality</td>
<td>Radical planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedural Rationality</td>
<td>Incrementalism</td>
<td>Advocacy planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Comprehensive planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicative Rationality</td>
<td>Traditional participatory planning</td>
<td>Transactive/collaborative planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mediation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Reflective Political Action</td>
<td>Social learning</td>
<td>Critical theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phenomenology</td>
<td>Social mobilization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contingency theory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moral Philosophy</td>
<td></td>
<td>Utopianism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cognitive Rationality, Conceptual Basis

A rational decision is one that

- the DM knows what ends the DM seeks
  - the public interest
- the DM considers all the alternatives
- the DM identifies and evaluates all the consequences of each alternative
- the DM selects that alternative with consequences that most probably maximizes the desired ends

Rationality focuses on

- the quality of decision
- the subordination of knowledge to values and of action to knowledge
Cognitive Rationality, Schools of Thought

System Improving
Synoptic Rationality

- Meyerson and Banfield
  - Politics, Planning and the Public Interest
- Paul Davidoff and Thomas Reiner
  - A Choice Theory of Planning
- Andreas Faludi
  - A Reader in Planning Theory

System Transforming
Radical Planning

- Robert Kraushcer
  - Outside the Whale: Progressive Planning and the Dilemmas of Radical Reform

Procedural Rationality, Conceptual Basis

- Synoptic rationality is essentially impossible
  - cognitive limits
  - resource limits
  - an infinite regression
- Procedural rationality seeks to approximate rational decision making within these limits
Procedural Rationality, Schools of Thought

System Improving
- Incrementalism
- Comprehensive Planning

- Charles E. Lindblom
  - The Science of Muddling Through

- Martin Meyerson
  - Building the Middle-Range Bridge for Comprehensive Planning

- Amitai Etzioni
  - Mixed Scanning: A Third Approach to Decision-Making

System Transforming
- Advocacy Planning

- Paul Davidoff
  - Advocacy and Pluralism in Planning

- David F. Mazziotti
  - The Underlying Assumptions of Advocacy Planning

- Norman Krumholz
  - A Retrospective View of Equity Planning in Cleveland, 1969-1979

Communicative Rationality, Conceptual Basis

- Planning is fundamentally linked to clarification of interests (desired ends)

- The selection of means cannot be isolated from the identification of valued ends

- Both are linked to community, and to the communicative acts that bind community together

- Emphasis on
  - transparency
  - inclusiveness
  - truth-seeking
Planning is a professional act that occurs within a political community

Political and social interaction are central activities

Truth is not fixed, but emerges from continuing search
Self-Reflective Political Action, Schools of Thought

System Improving
Social Learning, Phenomenology, Contingency Theory

- Donald Schon
  - The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action
- Richard S. Bolan
  - The Practitioner as Theorist: The Phenomenology of the Professional Episode
- John Bryson and Andre Delbecq
  - A Contingent Approach to Strategy and Tactics in Project Planning
- Charles Hoch
  - What Planners Do

System Transforming
Social Mobilization, Postmodern Critiques

- Saul Alinsky
  - Reveille for Radicals
- Robert A. Beauregard
- Susan S. Fainstein
  - Planning in a Different Voice

Moral Philosophy, Conceptual Basis

- Ends, without means
- An essential focus on values
  - clarification of values
  - clarification of the implication of values
  - clarification of desired ends
All of the following are known for their involvement in organizational approaches to citizen participation, except:

(A) Saul Alinsky
(B) Patrick Geddes
(C) Susan Arenstein
(D) Paul Davidoff